



GOTHIC IVORY SCULPTURE

CONTENT AND CONTEXT

EDITED BY
CATHERINE YVARD

Gothic Ivory Sculpture: Content and Context

Edited by Catherine Yvard

With contributions by:

Elisabeth Antoine-König
Katherine Eve Baker
Camille Broucke
Jack Hartnell
Franz Kirchweger
Juliette Levy-Hinstin
Christian Nikolaus Opitz
Stephen Perkinson
Naomi Speakman
Michelle Tomasi
Catherine Yvard

Series Editor:

Alixé Bovey

Managing Editor:

Maria Mileeva

Courtauld Books Online is published by
the Research Forum of The Courtauld Institute of Art
Somerset House, Strand, London WC2R 0RN
© 2017, The Courtauld Institute of Art, London.
ISBN: 978-1-907485-09-1.

Courtauld Books Online is a series of scholarly books published by The Courtauld Institute of Art. The series includes research publications that emerge from Courtauld Research Forum events and Courtauld projects involving an array of outstanding scholars from art history and conservation across the world. It is an open-access series, freely available to readers to read online and to download without charge. The series has been developed in the context of research priorities of The Courtauld which emphasise the extension of knowledge in the fields of art history and conservation, and the development of new patterns of explanation.

For more information contact booksonline@courtauld.ac.uk

All chapters of this book are available for download at courtauld.ac.uk/research/courtauld-books-online.

Every effort has been made to contact the copyright holders of images reproduced in this publication. This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs 3.0 Unported License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/3.0/). All rights reserved.

Designed by Matthew Cheale

Cover Image:

Detail of Fig. 10.1,
London, The British Museum, Inv. 1888,1217.1.
© Trustees of the British Museum.

CONTENTS

List of Illustrations	5
Notes on Contributors	8
Acknowledgements	10
Preface CATHERINE YVARD	11
I. Production and Uses: Thirteenth to Fourteenth Century	16
A Flagellation Scene Reunited: a Reassessment of Early Fourteenth-Century Ivory Altarpieces and <i>Tabernacula</i> ELISABETH ANTOINE-KÖNIG, JULIETTE LEVY-HINSTIN	17
Made in Cologne: New Perspectives on the Kremsmünster Workshop MICHELLE TOMASI	30
Buying, Gifting, Storing: Ivory Virgins in Documentary Sources from Late Medieval Central Europe CHRISTIAN NIKOLAUS OPITZ	46
II. Ivory Carving in Transition: Late Fifteenth to Early Sixteenth Century	56
Translated Images: from Print to Ivory in the Late Fifteenth and Early Sixteenth Century CATHERINE YVARD	57
'La Chambre aux dentz d'yvoire': an Introduction to the Inventory of Chicart Bailly KATHERINE EVE BAKER	68
Anatomical Impulses in Sixteenth-Century <i>Memento Mori</i> Ivories STEPHEN PERKINSON	76
III. Ivory and the Collector: Nineteenth to Twentieth Century	93
Gothic and Late Medieval Ivories from the Collection of Clemens Wenceslaus Count of Renesse-Breidbach FRANZ KIRCHWEGER	94

'A Great Harvest': the Acquisition of William Maskell's Ivory Collection by the British Museum NAOMI SPEAKMAN	111
On Paul Thoby, the Musée Dobrée and Medieval Ivories CAMILLE BROUCKE	125
Epilogue: Touching Ivory Online JACK HARTNELL	143
Photograph Credits	159

PART ONE

PRODUCTION AND USES: THIRTEENTH TO FOURTEENTH CENTURY



CHAPTER 2

MADE IN COLOGNE: NEW PERSPECTIVES ON THE KREMSMÜNSTER WORKSHOP

MICHELE TOMASI



Studies on Gothic ivories have expanded spectacularly over the past thirty years, in quantity, scope and method. A broad range of innovative approaches has been employed to better understand this long-neglected class of artefacts.¹ Nonetheless, given the vast number of surviving Gothic ivory carvings, their scattering in museums, church treasuries and private collections, and the rarity of securely dated and/or localised works, establishing their chronology and origin will remain a major task for scholars for years to come. Stylistic analysis will be an essential tool to this end, provided that style is correctly understood as the result of the conditions of production of a particular piece, be they material, cultural, social or intellectual.² This paper re-examines the group of ivory carvings first gathered by Raymond Koechlin under the name of 'Kremsmünster Workshop', after a diptych first documented in 1740 in the Treasury of Kremsmünster Abbey in Austria (fig. 2.1).³ Stylistic and iconographical observations will lead me to argue that these works were made in Cologne during the second half of the fourteenth century, a context that explains their formal, thematic and material peculiarities.

2.1
Diptych of the
Adoration of the Magi
and Crucifixion. Ivory,
15.5 x 10.6 cm.
Kremsmünster, Stift
Kremsmünster.

The case of the Kremsmünster Workshop is representative of the historiography of Gothic ivories. Since Koechlin attributed twenty-five objects or fragments to this workshop in his 1924 *magnum opus*,⁴ no systematic study has been conducted, and investigations have been advancing piecemeal, mostly through catalogue entries or articles on single objects.⁵ Koechlin thought the *atelier* was active in Paris during the last quarter of the fourteenth century and he credited it for having first translated into ivory the realism that prevailed in other media in France since the mid fourteenth century. However, in her unsurpassed synthesis on medieval ivories, Danielle Gaborit-Chopin advanced a radically different hypothesis. Observing the expressive quality of the carvings in this group, she suggested that the workshop could be German, drawing comparisons with Middle-Rhenish sculptures, especially with the *Memorienpforte* in Mainz Cathedral, dating to c.1420-25.⁶ She expanded her argument in a later article, adding more comparisons with Middle-Rhenish works.⁷ This position has been accepted by most scholars, including Charles T. Little,⁸ but there is still much disagreement about the dating and localisation of carvings in the group. Géza Jászai, in 1979, dated the Ochtrup-Langenhorst Virgin and Child statuette to c.1300-25 placing it in Mainz, while Andrea von Hülsen-Esch recently assigned it to Cologne and dated it to c.1340.⁹ Theo Jülich proposed a date of about 1330 and a localisation in the Rhineland for another Virgin and Child in Darmstadt, whereas Hartmut Krohm and Jürgen Fitschen favoured again a Parisian origin for other crucial works.¹⁰ Nor is there consensus on which pieces should be attributed to the workshop: Paul Williamson recently argued that the statuettes, usually considered as part of the group, should be dated earlier than the rest.¹¹

Moreover, the corpus is still expanding and new carvings have recently appeared that contribute to a better understanding of the whole group: a scene with the Death of the Virgin in the Chicago Art Institute has been recognised as a fragment of the left leaf of a diptych whose right wing is in Győr Cathedral Treasury.¹² During the editing process of this paper, Christian Opitz brought two more carvings, now in the Universalmuseum Joanneum in Graz, to the attention of Catherine Yvard, who recognised them as the probable missing fragments of the same diptych.¹³ Her attribution, based on style and iconography, was confirmed by the measuring of the Graz fragments.¹⁴ So a Marian diptych of the group is now complete, though scattered in three different places.

This paper cannot provide definitive answers, primarily due to the absence of documentary evidence, but also because I was only able to examine at first hand twenty out of a total of about fifty ivories that have, at one point or another, been related to the group. It is nevertheless worth casting a fresh eye on these artworks and on the questions they raise.

I would like, first of all, to stress the relative coherence of the group. A common pool of models was clearly available, freely used and adapted: two Crucifixions on diptychs in Berlin and New York thus show obvious affinities, mitigated by skilful variations.¹⁵ Two *Vierge glorieuse* diptych leaves now in Dublin and Palermo follow a similar pattern.¹⁶ The two Virgin statuettes in Cracow share the same handling of drapery on the front, but the



back of the Virgin on loan to the Wavel Royal Castle is closer to that of the statuette in the Bargello Museum, although a mirror version of it.¹⁷ Models were sometimes reused from one type of object to another: the small free-standing Virgin in the Louvre (fig. 2.2) is extremely close to the *Vierge glorieuse* on the aforementioned left leaf of the Metropolitan diptych (fig. 2.3), and the treatment of the drapery on a leaf fragment in the Musée Unterlinden in Colmar is very similar to that found on statuettes at the British Museum and the Toledo Museum of Art.¹⁸ Family resemblances also exist in the rendering of the Virgin's face on the statuettes in Darmstadt and Florence, and on two diptych leaves in the Louvre and the Musée de Cluny.¹⁹

Technique also should be taken into account when trying to understand the relationships between pieces within the group. The best works, such as the large diptych leaves in Berlin and in Lyon, are carved with deep undercutting, while some other works, such as a smaller diptych leaf in Florence, are much flatter.²⁰ The means of the buyers probably

2.2
Statuette of the Virgin
and Child. Ivory, 24
x 7.3 x 3.9 cm. Paris,
Musée du Louvre,
Département des Objets
d'Art, Inv. 12101.



played a role in this, since deeper relief implied more work on the part of the craftsman. Yet the Virgin statuettes are always shallow, being carved out of sections at the base of the tusk (around the pulp cavity), rather than from its fuller upper part. Most statuettes share the same weaknesses: the figure of Christ lost its head or broke away altogether in at least eleven out of seventeen cases.²¹ It is also worth noting that many Virgins hold a drilled cylinder where a metal flower would have once been inserted (probably made of silver).²²

These formal and material affinities are strong enough evidence to argue that most of the statuettes and diptych leaves should be considered together. This does not mean however that all objects were carved by the same hand. The face of the standing Virgin in the Louvre is so close to that of her enthroned sister in Compiègne that one might well assign them to a single carver²³ but, if we compare the Darmstadt and Compiègne Virgins, the latter shows a much more complex handling of drapery and a subtler use of the drill to pick out facial details.²⁴ Further research will be necessary to clearly establish the relationships between the different pieces of the group, but it is certain that more than one artist was involved in the production of these artefacts, probably over a few decades.

If we accept that panels and statuettes form a relatively close-knit ensemble, the approximate chronology of the group becomes easier to establish. As Gaborit-Chopin pointed out, the composition of certain Passion scenes, for instance on the Baltimore and Lyon leaves, is derived from the large Passion diptychs group, which can reasonably be placed in Paris at the end of the reign of Charles V.²⁵ This would imply that the Kremsmünster ivories date from slightly later.

Concerning the geographical origin, Paris seems out of question: the very distinctive and vehement style of the group does not fit into the development of Parisian Gothic ivory

2.3
Diptych of the Virgin and Child and Crucifixion. Ivory, 15.6 x 19.7 cm. New York, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, Inv. 1971.49.3a-b.



carving. The Rhenish solution suggested by many writers is however a more promising alternative. Provenance information is usually of little help, as it tends to be too recent, yet it is interesting to note that, out of the eight oldest known provenances for carvings of the group (pre-1840), seven point to locations east of the Rhine. The crozier in Amsterdam was in Liesborn Abbey (Westphalia) before 1811; the triptych in Copenhagen appeared in inventories of the Gottorf Kunstkammer from 1710 onwards; the Darmstadt statuette was acquired in 1805 from the Hüpsch collection that comprised ivories mostly with a provenance from the Lower Rhine or the Meuse region;²⁶ the Graz fragments entered the Joanneum in 1817 coming from the Maria Saal pilgrimage church in Carinthia; the diptych in the Klosterneuburg Treasury has probably been there since the seventeenth century and the one in Kremsmünster, at least since 1740; finally, the fragment of a diptych leaf in Munich was in the Ambras collection before 1811.²⁷ The diptych leaf in the Bargello Museum is the odd one out, coming from the collection of Canon Apollonio Bassetti (d. 1699), but we know that Bassetti travelled to Belgium, the Netherlands and Germany in 1667-8.²⁸

Some formal details also point towards the Rhineland. The tiled roofs that appear in some diptychs of the group, such as those in Kremsmünster (fig. 2.1) and in the Musée de Cluny, have been considered as probable evidence of a German origin.²⁹ Furthermore, on the left leaf of the former, the Virgin and Child sit on a throne whose base is decorated with pierced quatrefoils, a highly unusual detail in ivory carving. Similar ornaments however frequently appear on fourteenth-century sculptures from Cologne, such as the beautiful Annunciation from the main altar of Cologne Cathedral (c.1322, Cologne, Museum Schnütgen, Inv. K 210) or the Adoration of the Magi from Sankt Maria im Capitol (c.1310, on loan to the Museum Schnütgen).³⁰ The motif is also recurrent on Cologne wooden statuettes of this period.³¹

2.4
Statuette of the Virgin and Child. Ivory, 11.7 x 6 x 5.4 cm. Saint Petersburg, The State Hermitage Museum, Inv. F-3225.

2.5
Statuette of the Virgin and Child. Boxwood, height: 28.5 cm. Cologne, Museum für Angewandte Kunst, Inv. A 1172.



Although stylistic comparisons are difficult, partly because narrative cycles are very rare in Rhenish sculpture during the fourteenth century, the line of inquiry opened by Jászai, Jülich and von Hülsen-Esch, who first drew comparisons with Cologne pieces, is worth pursuing. Focusing on figures of the standing Virgin and Child is particularly fruitful, since Rhenish elements of comparison in other media are more readily available for this type of object. The face of the Virgin in the Kremsmünster group is framed by curly hair and characterised by a small nose and mouth, and by a pointed chin over a double chin (fig. 2.4). Similar features are recurrent in Cologne statuettes of the second half of the fourteenth century, such as the boxwood Virgin and Child in the Cologne Museum für Angewandte Kunst (fig. 2.5; Inv. A1172 Cl.), or the celebrated walnut Virgin and Child of the Thyssen-Bornemisza collection (on loan to the Universalmuseum Joanneum, Alte Galerie, Graz), both dated to c.1360-70.³² The treatment of the reverse of the statuettes is even more noteworthy. When viewed from the back, all Kremsmünster statuettes show a similar organisation of the drapery, with two small beak folds right under the arms and a few larger curvilinear folds stretching lower down (fig. 2.6). Although this system of folds occasionally appears on French Virgins, French ivory statuettes more often adopt a central tubular fold going down the whole length of the cloak, an arrangement closer to that typical of thirteenth-century examples.³³ On the contrary, a number of Cologne Virgins share the Kremsmünster drapery treatment: not only the Thyssen statuette already mentioned, but also other works of the same period, such as the Friesentor Madonna in the Museum Schnütgen (Inv. A 40) or the Zollturm Madonna in the Zons Museum, respectively dated to c.1360-70 and c.1380 (fig. 2.7).³⁴ These comparisons confirm a dating in the last third of the fourteenth century for the Kremsmünster group.

The attribution to Cologne might be further supported by an iconographical argument. The group comprises two diptychs with scenes from the life of the Virgin, which is quite

2.6
Statuette of the Virgin and Child. Ivory, height: 20 cm. The British Museum, London, Inv. 1856,0623.148.

2.7
Statue of the Virgin and Child. Sandstone, height: 71.5 cm. Zons, Kreismuseum.



rare in Gothic ivories. One survives in an incomplete state, split between Berlin and London (fig. 2.8),³⁵ while the other is the one divided between the Győr Cathedral Treasury, the Universalmuseum Joanneum in Graz and the Art Institute in Chicago.³⁶ Their atypical iconography and compositions are also found on two other nearly identical works:³⁷ an ivory diptych formerly in the Kofler-Truniger collection and a boxwood diptych in the Kolumba Museum in Cologne (fig. 2.9).³⁸ The latter probably came from Sankt Maria im Kapitol and had long been considered a mid-fourteenth-century Cologne work when Peter Bloch declared it to be an 1860s neo-Gothic creation by the sculptor Nikolaus Elscheidt.³⁹ But the works attributed by Bloch to Elscheidt are too disparate in style and quality to all be accepted as the products of a single hand, and even if some of his attributions are convincing, some pieces have been too quickly dismissed by the scholar as nineteenth-century artefacts.⁴⁰ The boxwood diptych was declared a copy only because it was identical to the Kofler-Truniger diptych, and Elscheidt was identified as the author simply because he was working for Sankt Maria im Kapitol from 1868. The ivory diptych was first described by

2.8
Diptych leaf with scenes from the life of the Virgin. Ivory, 22.2 x 12.1 cm. Berlin, Skulpturensammlung und Museum für Byzantinische Kunst, Inv. 2722.



Westwood in 1876, two years after Elscheidt's death, when it was in the Possenti collection in Fabriano,⁴¹ no photograph of it was published until 1880,⁴² and no cast of it was, as far as we know, ever available. The Cologne sculptor is therefore quite unlikely to have copied it at the end of his life and, unless new and compelling evidence comes to light, it seems reasonable to accept the Kolumba diptych as a genuine fourteenth-century Cologne work. The question of its relationship to the Kofler ivory, although opening interesting perspectives, is beyond the scope of the present article. If we accept the boxwood diptych as an authentic mid-fourteenth-century work, the fact that its peculiar iconography is also found in products of the Kremsmünster Workshop becomes yet another argument in favour of a Cologne origin for the ivory carvings.

Although Marian scenes also appear on Parisian fourteenth-century ivories, notably in a beautiful group of triptychs dating to the 1320s-30s,⁴³ the iconography used by the Kremsmünster Workshop is still quite remarkable. Its focus on the death and glorification of Mary, its scope and some of its details are rare, especially north of the Alps.⁴⁴ Many other works from the corpus also present unusual iconographical features. The Virgin trampling the dragon, carved on leaves in Colmar, Dublin, formerly Langres, New York and Palermo, seldom appears on French ivories, and then mostly on objects of the early fourteenth century.⁴⁵ Angels mourning over Christ's sacrifice in the Crucifixion are also a notable detail, as is the diminutive figure of Adam collecting the blood of Christ at the foot of the cross.⁴⁶ On French ivories, in the Crucifixion, Longinus is most often represented kneeling in prayer beside the cross. In the Kremsmünster group, another composition is systematically adopted, where he touches his eyes, miraculously healed of his blindness by the jet of Christ's blood, as in carvings in Baltimore, Berlin, Klosterneuburg and Paris.⁴⁷ The Virgin always helps Christ carry the cross, as in the Berlin, Klosterneuburg and Lyon examples, a detail that also appears on French ivories, but less frequently.⁴⁸

2.9
Diptych with scenes
from the life of the Vir-
gin (Cologne, c.1350).
Boxwood, 19.4 x 10.2
cm (each leaf). Cologne,
Kolumba, Inv. A 80-60.

The Kremsmünster ivories are far from being standardised products. Carved in a meticulous and labour-intensive way, many objects were certainly conceived and created for specific patrons, rather than for anonymous buyers. Although we know little about the ways ivory objects were actually produced and sold, it seems improbable that elaborate and impressive works, made out of a rare material and showing specific iconographies, were carved on speculation. While many diptych leaves are using thick panels, the statuettes are carved making the most out of thin plaques of ivory, in a way that seems to imply that the raw material was not readily available, even for relatively ambitious creations. This would indicate a different system of production from that which we find in Paris where, in the second half of the fourteenth century, even high-quality works often followed well established and widely reproduced patterns, and where the supply of elephant tusks was not an issue. The singular features of the Kremsmünster group would rather point in the direction of a market less developed than that of Paris, a market such as we could expect to find in Cologne. Yet it is apparent that French models were available to our carvers, a situation that would also correspond to what we know of the artistic milieu in the great Rhenish city during the Gothic period.⁴⁹ In the fourteenth century, ivory carving tended to emancipate itself from monumental sculpture, developing an inner formal and iconographical coherence. Meanwhile, Paris remained the point of reference in Europe for ivory carving. Such a model, if we accept it, might explain why it is so difficult to find definitive stylistic comparisons for ivories of the Kremsmünster group in other media. French scholars believe that the Kremsmünster ivories cannot be Parisian, German scholars that they cannot be German. Their controversial and elusive character, their particular mixture of French and German features, their idiosyncrasies may be the result of a different system of production determined by specific commissions in the most Francophile city of the Empire.

Appendix

A. Carvings belonging to the Kremsmünster group⁵⁰

1. [Amsterdam, Rijksmuseum, Inv. BK-16991](#), crozier with *Vierge glorieuse* and Crucifixion. Frits Scholten and Guido de Werd (eds.), *Eine höhere Wirklichkeit* (Kleve: Museum Kurhaus, 2004), pp. 158-61, no. 54.
2. [Baltimore, The Walters Art Museum, Inv. 71.246](#), statuette of standing Virgin and Child. Richard H. Randall, Jr., *Masterpieces of Ivory from the Walters Art Gallery* (New York: Hudson Hills Press, 1985), pp. 208-09, no. 284.
3. [Baltimore, The Walters Art Museum, Inv. 71.156](#), left leaf of a diptych with three Passion scenes. *Ibid.*, pp. 220-1, no. 313. Formed a diptych with A30.
4. [Berlin, Skulpturensammlung und Museum für Byzantinische Kunst, Inv. 645, 646](#), diptych with four Passion scenes. Regine Marth (ed.), *Glanz der Ewigkeit. Meisterwerke aus*

Elfenbein der Staatlichen Museen zu Berlin (Berlin: Staatliche Museen zu Berlin, 1999), pp. 120-1, no. 46.

5. Berlin, Skulpturensammlung und Museum für Byzantinische Kunst, Inv. 654, right leaf of a diptych with Crucifixion. Ibid., p. 122, no. 47.

6. Berlin, Skulpturensammlung und Museum für Byzantinische Kunst, Inv. 656, fragment of leaf with Crucifixion. Ibid., p. 123, no. 48.

7. Berlin, Skulpturensammlung und Museum für Byzantinische Kunst, Inv. 663, relief with enthroned Virgin and Child. Ibid., p. 126, no. 50.

8. Berlin, Skulpturensammlung und Museum für Byzantinische Kunst, Inv. 2722, left leaf of a diptych with three scenes of the Death and Glorification of the Virgin. Ibid., pp. 124-5, no. 49. The bottom fragment of the right leaf is A28.

9. Chicago, The Chicago Art Institute, Inv. 1943.60, fragment of left leaf of a diptych with Death of the Virgin. Richard H. Randall, Jr., *The Golden Age of Ivory. Gothic Carvings from American Collections* (New York: Hudson Hills Press, 1993), p. 107, no. 149. The two missing fragments of the same leaf are A20; the right leaf of the diptych is A21.

10. Colmar, Musée Unterlinden, Inv. 91.5.1, fragment of diptych leaf with *Vierge glorieuse*. Pantxika Béguerie, 'La Vierge à l'Enfant de l'atelier du diptyque de Kremsmünster', *Bulletin de la Société Schongauer* 1987-92 (1993), pp. 91-7, 186.

11. Compiègne, Musée Antoine Vivenel, Inv. L.330, statuette of enthroned Virgin and Child. Raymond Koechlin, *Les Ivoires gothiques français* (Paris: Auguste Picard, 1924), I, p. 301, II, p. 312, n. 841, III, pl. CLI.

12. Copenhagen, Nationalmuseet, Inv. 10359, triptych with the Virgin, Saint Clare and Saint Francis. Niels K. Liebgott, *Elfenben - fra Danmarks Middelalder* (Copenhagen: Nationalmuseet, 1985), pp. 54-5, no. 50.

13. Cracow, Wawel Royal Castle, Inv. dep. 681, statuette of standing Virgin and Child. Danielle Gaborit-Chopin, 'Réapparition d'une Vierge en ivoire gothique', in *Objets d'art: mélanges en l'honneur de Daniel Alcouffe* (Dijon: Faton, 2004), pp. 47-55, esp. p. 49, 52-3.

14. Cracow, Czartoryski Museum, Inv. XIII-928, statuette of standing Virgin and Child. Ibid., pp. 49, 53.

15. Darmstadt, Hessisches Landesmuseum, Inv. Pl 36:87, statuette of enthroned Virgin and Child. Theo Jülich, *Die mittelalterlichen Elfenbeinarbeiten des Hessischen Landesmuseum Darmstadt* (Regensburg: Schnell und Steiner, 2011), pp. 192-3, no. 42.

16. Dijon, Musée des Beaux-Arts, Inv. CA T 328, statuette of enthroned Virgin and Child. Emmanuel Starcky, Hélène Meyer and Catherine Gras, *Le Musée des Beaux-Arts de Dijon* (Ghent: Ludion, 1992), pp. 20-1.

17. [Dublin, National Museum of Ireland, Inv. 1906:156](#), left leaf of a diptych with *Virge glorieuse*. Charles T. Little, 'Gothic Ivory Carving in Germany', in Peter Barnet (ed.), *Images in Ivory: Precious Objects of the Gothic Age* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1997), pp. 80-93, esp. p. 93, note 36.
18. [Florence, Museo Nazionale del Bargello, Inv. 9 A](#), left leaf of a diptych with Nativity and Crucifixion. Benedetta Chiesi, *Catalogo degli avori gotici del Museo Nazionale del Bargello* (PhD diss., Università degli Studi di Firenze, 2011), pp. 468-75, no. 37
19. [Florence, Museo Nazionale del Bargello, Inv. 91 C](#), statuette of standing Virgin and Child. *Ibid.*, pp. 476-83, no. 38.
20. [Graz, Universalmuseum Joanneum, Museum im Palais, Inv. 913 and 914](#), two fragments of the left leaf of a diptych with scenes of the Death of the Virgin. See [Ulrich Becker, Nina Bachler, 'Aus der Frühzeit des Joanneums: Zwei gotische Elfenbeinreliefs', *Museumsblog*, 22 April 2015](#). The lower fragment of the same leaf is A9, the right leaf is A21.
21. [Győr, Cathedral Treasury, Inv. Gy 77. 49](#), right leaf of a diptych with three scenes of the Death and Glorification of the Virgin. Peter Bokody (ed.), *Image and Christianity: visual media in the Middle Ages* (Pannonhalma: Pannonhalmi Főapátság, 2014), pp. 266-7, no. 33. The bottom fragment of the left leaf is A9, its two upper fragments are A20.
22. [Klosterneuburg, Stift Klosterneuburg, Inv. KG 155](#), diptych with six Passion scenes. Wolfgang Christian Huber (ed.), *Die Schatzkammer im Stift Klosterneuburg* (Wettin: Stekovics, 2011), pp. 60-1, no. 12.
23. [Kremsmünster, Stift Kremsmünster](#), diptych with Adoration of the Magi and Crucifixion. Koechlin, *Ivoires gothiques français*, II, pp. 304-05, no. 824, III, pl. CXLVII.
24. [Langres, Musée d'Art et d'Histoire Guy-Baillet](#) (stolen in 1977), left leaf of a diptych with *Virge glorieuse*. *Ibid.*, II, p. 305, no. 825, III, pl. CXLVIII. The right leaf of the diptych is A38.
25. [Lisbon, Calouste Gulbenkian Museum, Inv. 2287](#), diptych with *Virge glorieuse* and Crucifixion. Sarah M. Guérin, *Gothic Ivories. Calouste Gulbenkian Collection* (London: Scala, 2015), pp. 110-13, no. 10.
26. [London, The British Museum, Inv. 1856,0623.71](#), right leaf of a diptych with Adoration of the Magi and Coronation of the Virgin. Henk van Os, *The Art of Devotion in the Late Middle Ages* (London: Merrel Holberton, 1994), p. 74, fig. 29. The left leaf is A34.
27. [London, The British Museum, Inv. 1856,0623.148](#), statuette of standing Virgin and Child. Ormonde M. Dalton, *Catalogue of the Ivory Carvings of the Christian Era in the British Museum* (London: Printed by order of the Trustees, 1909), p. 115, no. 332, pl. LXXV.

28. London, The British Museum, Inv. 1978,0502.5, fragment of the right leaf of a diptych with funeral procession of the Virgin. James Robinson, *Masterpieces. Medieval Art* (London: The British Museum, 2008), p. 125. The left leaf is A8.
29. London, The British Museum, Inv. 1980,0102.1, statuette of enthroned Virgin and Child. Little, 'Gothic Ivory Carving', p. 93, note 36.
30. Lyon, Musée des Beaux-Arts, Inv. L 404, left leaf of a diptych with three Passion scenes. Christian Briend, *Les Objets d'Art: guide des collections. Musée de Beaux-Arts de Lyon* (Paris: Réunion des musées nationaux, 1993), p. 23, fig. 8. Formed a diptych with A3.
31. Maastricht, Bonnenfantenmuseum, on loan from the Neutelings Foundation, Inv. 10-5423, central panel of a triptych with the Death and Coronation of the Virgin. Scholten and de Werd, *Eine höhere Wirklichkeit*, pp. 176-8, no. 61.
32. Munich, Bayerisches Nationalmuseum, Inv. MA 2009, statuette of enthroned Virgin and Child. Rudolf Berliner, *Die Bildwerke des Bayerischen Nationalmuseums, IV: Die Bildwerke in Elfenbein, Knochen, Hirsch- und Steinbockhorn* (Augsburg: Filser, 1926), p. 16, no. 31.
33. Munich, Bayerisches Nationalmuseum, Inv. MA 2037, fragment of the left leaf of a diptych with Arrest of Christ. *Ibid.*, p. 19, no. 45.
34. New York, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, Inv. 32.100.203, left leaf of a diptych with Nativity and Crucifixion. Koechlin, *Ivoires gothiques français*, II, p. 309, no. 834. The right leaf is A26.
35. New York, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, Inv. 1971.49.3a-b, diptych with *Vierge glorieuse* and Crucifixion. Hermann Schnitzler, Fritz Volbach and Peter Bloch, *Sammlung E. und M. Kofler-Truniger, I: Skulpturen: Elfenbein, Perlmutter, Stein, Holz. Europäisches Mittelalter* (Stuttgart: Räber, 1964), pp. 28-9, no. S 93.
36. Ochtrup-Langenhorst, Catholic Parish Church St John the Baptist, Stiftskammer, statuette of standing Virgin and Child. Dagmar Täube and Miriam Verena Fleck (eds.), *Glanz und Größe des Mittelalters. Kölner Meisterwerke aus den grossen Sammlungen der Welt* (Munich: Hirmer, 2011), pp. 269-70, no. 25.
37. Palermo, Galleria Regionale della Sicilia di Palazzo Abatellis, Inv. 11430, left leaf of a diptych with *Vierge glorieuse*. Vincenzo Abbate (ed.), *Wunderkammer siciliana: alle origini del museo perduto* (Naples: Electa, 2001), pp. 232-3, no. II.51.
38. Paris, Musée de Cluny – Musée national du Moyen Âge, Inv. Cl. 10904, right leaf of a diptych with Crucifixion. Élisabeth Taburet-Delahaye, *Les Ivoires du Musée de Cluny* (Paris: Réunion des musées nationaux, 1988), p. 17. The left leaf is A24, formerly in Langres.

39. Paris, Musée du Louvre, Inv. OA 7276, right leaf of a diptych with Crucifixion. Danielle Gaborit-Chopin, *Ivoires médiévaux V^e-XV^e siècle* (Paris: Réunion des musées nationaux, 2003), pp. 485-6, no. 220.
40. Paris, Musée du Louvre, Inv. OA 11042, statuette of enthroned Virgin and Child. Ibid., pp. 480-1, no. 216.
41. Paris, Musée du Louvre, Inv. OA 12101, statuette of standing Virgin and Child. Gaborit-Chopin, 'Réapparition'.
42. Sacramento, Crocker Art Museum, Inv. 1960.3.77, fragment of the left leaf of a diptych with Entombment. Randall, *The Golden Age*, p. 107, no. 150.
43. Saint Petersburg, The State Hermitage Museum, Inv. F-3225, statuette of enthroned Virgin and Child. *Christliche westeuropäische Elfenbeinkunst 13.-18. Jahrhundert aus der Ermitage Sankt Petersburg* (Erbach: Deutsches Elfenbeinmuseum, 1993), no. 11.
44. Toledo, The Toledo Museum of Art, Inv. 50.305, statuette of standing Virgin and Child. Randall, *The Golden Age*, pp. 43-4, no. 23.
45. Unknown location, diptych with *Vierge glorieuse* and Crucifixion. Sale, Auktionshaus Geble, Radolfzell, 9 November 2013.

B. Carvings related to the group

1. Amiens, Musée de Picardie, Inv. M.P. 3063.550, diptych with Adoration of the Magi and Crucifixion. Koechlin, *Ivoires gothiques français*, II, p. 306, no. 827.
2. Cracow, Wawel Royal Castle, Inv. 4149/1-2, diptych with Passion scenes. Stanisława Link-Lenczowska and Joanna Winiewicz-Wolska (eds.), *Sapiehowie. Kolekcjonerzy i mecenas, Zamek Królewski na Wawelu* (Cracow: Zamek Królewski na Wawelu, 2011), p. 292, no. 137.
3. Paris, Musée de Cluny – Musée national du Moyen Âge, Inv. Cl. 441, right leaf of a diptych with Crucifixion. Koechlin, *Ivoires gothiques français*, II, p. 307, no. 830.
4. Paris, Musée des Arts Décoratifs, Inv. GR 29, statuette of seated Virgin and Child. Ibid., II, p. 250, no. 689.
5. Saint Petersburg, The State Hermitage Museum, Inv. F 3196, right leaf of a diptych with Crucifixion. Ibid., II, p. 306, no. 826.
6. Turin, Museo Civico d'Arte Antica, Inv. 144/AV, writing tablet with Crucifixion. Simonetta Castronovo, Fabrizio Crivello and Michele Tomasi (eds.), *Avori Medievali. Collezioni del Museo Civico d'Arte Antica di Torino* (Savigliano: L'Artistica Savigliano, 2016), pp. 130-1, no. 20.

7. Unknown location, statuette of enthroned Virgin and Child. Sale, *Hôtel des ventes de Neuilly*, 7 December 1997, lot 87.

8. Utrecht, Catharijneconvent, Inv. BMH bi1871, diptych with scenes of the Infancy and Passion of Christ. Roland Koekkoek, *Gotische Ivoren in het Catharijneconvent* (Zuphen: De Walburg Pers, 1987), pp. 70-5, no. 12.

C. Doubtful attributions

1. Frankfurt am Main Museum für Angewandte Kunst, Inv. 6471, diptych with Adoration of the Magi and Crucifixion. See *Kunst und Kunsthandwerk des Mittelalters* (Frankfurt am Main: Museum für Kunsthandwerk, 1966), no. 232, fig. 27.

2. Toronto, The Thomson Collection at the Art Gallery of Ontario, Inv. 29111, diptych with Nativity and Crucifixion.

All references in *Courtauld Books Online* are hyperlinked. To navigate to a footnote, click on the reference number in the body of the text. To return back to the main text, click on the number at the beginning of the footnote.

All hyperlinks directing to online resources were checked and valid at the date of 14 March 2017.

I would like to thank all the people who assisted me, either by giving me access to works in their custody or by supplying images and information: Élisabeth Antoine-König, Ulrich Becker, Peter Bokody, Olivier Caumont, Julien Chapuis, Benedetta Chiesi, Sarah Guérin, Salima Hellal, Michel Huyhn, Claire Iselin, Hiltrud Jehle, Sophie Jugie, Marie Laursen, Olga Novoseltseva, Naomi Speakman, Élisabeth Taburet-Delahaye, Alex Ward and Matthias Weniger. I presented this material in a different form at the conference 'Gothic Ivory Sculpture: Old Questions, New Directions' in London in 2012 and at Brno University in 2014. I am grateful to Ivan Foletti, Danielle Gaborit-Chopin, Andrea von Hülsen-Esch, Charles Little, Neil Stratford, Hiltrud Westermann-Angerhausen and Paul Williamson for their comments on these occasions. Special thanks go to Catherine Yvard for her support, patience and help in improving this text.

1. Glyn Davies and Sarah M. Guérin, 'Introduction', *Sculpture Journal* 23:1 (2014): pp. 7-12.

2. Bruno Klein and Bruno Boerner (eds.), *Stilfragen zur Kunst des Mittelalters* (Berlin: Reimer, 2006).

3. Raymond Koechlin, 'Un atelier d'ivoiriers de la fin du XIV^e siècle', *Bulletin de la Société de l'Histoire de l'art français* (1910): pp. 16-19.

4. Raymond Koechlin, *Les Ivoires gothiques français* (Paris: Auguste Picard, 1924), I, pp. 299-306, II, nos. 824-46.

5. See the bibliography listed in notes 9 and 10. For a list of works related to the Kremsmünster group, see the Appendix at the end of the present article: carvings will hereafter be designated by their number in the appendix.

6. Danielle Gaborit-Chopin, *Ivoires du Moyen Âge* (Fribourg: Office du Livre, 1978), pp. 169-70.

7. Danielle Gaborit-Chopin, 'Réapparition d'une Vierge en ivoire gothique', in *Objets d'art: mélanges en l'honneur de Daniel Alcouffé* (Dijon: Faton, 2004), pp. 47-55.

8. Charles T. Little, 'Gothic Ivory Carving in Germany', in Peter Barnet (ed.), *Images in Ivory: Precious Objects of the Gothic Age* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1997), pp. 80-93, esp. pp. 91-3.

9. Appendix A36. Géza Jászai, 'Nordfranzösisch oder mittelrheinisch? Zur Elfenbein-Madonna der Kirche des ehemaligen Augustinerinnenklosters in Langenhorst', *Westfalen* 47 (1979): pp. 16-23; Andrea von Hülsen-Esch, 'Paris-Köln und zurück. Gedanken zur Madonna von Ochtrup-Langenhorst und der Elfenbeinproduktion im Rheinland', in Andrea von Hülsen-Esch and Dagmar Täube (eds.), *Luft unter die Flügel... Beiträge zur mittelalterlichen Kunst: Festschrift für Hiltrud Westermann-Angerhausen* (Hildesheim, Munich and New York: Olms, 2010), pp. 173-85.

10. Appendix A 15. Theo Jülich, *Die mittelalterlichen*

Elfenbeinarbeiten des Hessischen Landesmuseum Darmstadt (Regensburg: Schnell und Steiner, 2011), pp. 192-3, no. 42; Jürgen Fitschen, in Regine Marth (ed.), *Glanz der Ewigkeit. Meisterwerke aus Elfenbein der Staatlichen Museen zu Berlin* (Berlin: Staatliche Museen zu Berlin, 1999), pp. 120-6, nos. 46-50; Hartmut Krohm, 'Die mittelalterlichen Elfenbeine', in *Stadtmuseum Münster. Elfenbein, Alabaster und Porzellan aus der Sammlung des fürstbischöflichen Ministers Ferdinand von Plattenberg und der Freiherren von Ketteler* (Berlin: Kultur-Stiftung der Länder, 2001), pp. 6-35, esp. pp. 26-9.

11. Paul Williamson and Glyn Davies, *Medieval Ivory Carvings 1200-1550* (London: V&A Publishing, 2014), p. 53.

12. Appendix A9 and A21. I suggested the pairing of these carvings in my London presentation of 2012. The same conclusion was independently reached by Zsombor Jekely: see Zsombor Jekely, 'Gothic Ivories in Hungary', *Medieval Hungary Blog*, 6 October 2013, <http://jekely.blogspot.co.uk/search?q=ivories>.

13. Appendix A20. The museum recognised the link with the Kremsmünster group, but not the association with the Chicago fragment and the Győr wing.

14. I am grateful to Ulrich Becker, curator at the Museum im Palais, for sending me the measurements of the fragments.

15. Appendix A5 and A35.

16. Appendix A17 and A37.

17. Appendix A13, A14 and A19.

18. Appendix A41, A35, A10, A27 and A44.

19. Appendix A15, A19, A39 and A38.

20. Appendix A8, A30 and A18.

21. Head missing: appendix A13, A19, A27, A29 and A32. Whole figure missing or remains recarved: appendix A2, A41. Head glued back into place: appendix A11. Head replaced: appendix A14, A40, B4. The head of Christ Child is intact on the statuettes in Dijon (appendix A16) and in Berlin (appendix A7), which I was able to examine myself. No damages have been mentioned in the scholarly literature for the other four statuettes.

22. Appendix A13, A15, A16, A32, A36. In almost all other statuettes or panels of the group, the Virgin holds either a bird or a branch of roses carved in ivory, so the missing silver element was probably a stem of roses, rather than lilies or a sceptre. On the iconography of the Virgin holding a rose, see Gertrud Schiller, *Ikongraphie der christlichen Kunst*, IV-2: *Maria* (Gütersloh: Gerd Mohn, 1980), p. 205.

23. Appendix A41 and A11.

-
24. Appendix A15 and A11.
25. Gaborit-Chopin, 'Réapparition', p. 50.
26. Jülich, *Die mittelalterlichen Elfenbeinarbeiten*, p. 15.
27. Appendix A1, A12, A15, A20, A22, A23, A33.
28. Appendix A18. Roberto Cantagalli, 'Bassetti, Apollonio', in *Dizionario Biografico degli Italiani* (Rome: Treccani, 1965), VII, pp. 117-18.
29. Charles T. Little, 'Kölnner Elfenbeinschnitzereien der Gotik: Viele offene Fragen', in Dagmar Täube and Miriam Verena Fleck (eds.), *Glanz und Grösse des Mittelalters. Kölner Meisterwerke aus den grossen Sammlungen der Welt* (Munich: Hirmer, 2011), pp. 82-9, esp. p. 88. See Appendix A23, A38.
30. For the Annunciation, see: Täube and Fleck (eds.), *Glanz und Grösse*, pp. 353-5, no. 100-3; for the Adoration, see: Manuela Beer, Iris Metje and Karen Straub (eds.), *Die Heiligen Drei Könige: Mythos, Kunst und Kult* (Munich: Hirmer, 2014), pp. 159-61, no. 58.
31. For example, the wooden enthroned Virgin of c.1340 in the Museum Schnütgen, Inv. A 773: Ulrike Bergmann, *Schnütgen-Museum: die Holzskulpturen des Mittelalters (1110-1400)* (Cologne: Locher 1989), pp. 292-5, no. 78.
32. Robert Suckale (ed.), *Schöne Madonnen am Rhein* (Leipzig: Seemann, 2009), p. 205, no. 36 and pp. 208-09, no. 44.
33. See for instance two statuettes in the Louvre, *Inv. OA 6076* and *OA 9957*: Danielle Gaborit-Chopin, *Ivoires médiévaux: V^e-XV^e siècle* (Paris: Réunion des musées nationaux, 2003), p. 372, no. 138 and pp. 427-8, no. 180; or one in the Metropolitan Museum of Art, *Inv. 30.95.114a*.
34. Suckale (ed.), *Schöne Madonnen*, pp. 205-06, no. 38 and p. 218, no. 62.
35. Appendix A8 (left leaf) and A28 (lower register of the right leaf).
36. Appendix A20 (upper registers of the left leaf), A9 (lower register of the left leaf) and A21 (right leaf).
37. This was first recognised by Katalín David, in 'Rekonstruktion des Elfenbeindiptychons von Győr/Raab', *Ars Decorativa* 7 (1982), pp. 5-17.
38. Hermann Schnitzler, Fritz Vollbach and Peter Bloch, *Sammlung E. und M. Kofler-Truniger, I: Skulpturen: Elfenbein, Perlmutter, Stein, Holz. Europäisches Mittelalter* (Stuttgart: Räber, 1964), p. 23, no. S. 64; Walter Schulten, *Kostbarkeiten in Köln. Erzbischöfliches Diözesanmuseum. Katalog* (Cologne: Greven, 1978), p. 74, no. 179.
39. Antje Middeldorf Kosegarten, 'Inkunabeln der gotischen Kleinplastik in Hartholz', *Pantheon* 22 (1964): pp. 302-21; Peter Bloch, 'Neugotische Statuetten des Nikolaus Elscheidt', in Lucius Griesbach and Konrad Renger (eds.), *Festschrift für Otto von Simson zum 65. Geburtstag* (Frankfurt: Propyläen, 1977), pp. 504-15, esp. p. 513.
40. Robert Suckale, *Das mittelalterliche Bild als Zeitzeuge* (Berlin: Lukas, 2002), p. 152, note 46, already cast doubts on some attributions by Bloch criticising the 'methodological off-handedness of his approach'.
41. John Obadiah Westwood, *A Descriptive Catalogue of the Fictile Ivories in the South Kensington Museum* (London: Chapman & Hall, 1876), pp. 373-4.
42. *Catalogue d'objets d'art et de curiosité formant la collection de feu M. le Comte Girolamo Possenti de Fabriano* (Rome, 1880), p. 7, no. 40 with plate.
43. Koechlin, *Ivoires gothiques français*, I, pp. 138-41, II, pp. 89-94, nos. 210-19bis, III, pl. LII-V; Gaborit-Chopin, *Ivoires médiévaux*, pp. 386-9, nos. 152-3; Sarah M. Guérin, *Gothic Ivories. Calouste Gulbenkian Collection* (London: Scala, 2015), pp. 94-103, no. 7.
44. See Schiller, *Iconography*, pp. 121-31. The author, who was unaware of the existence of the Kofler diptych, commented on the Cologne boxwood diptych, and her remarks naturally also apply to the Kremsmünster ivories.
45. For an early fourteenth-century example, see a diptych leaf in the Louvre, *Inv. OA 11097*: Gaborit-Chopin, *Ivoires médiévaux*, pp. 342-4, no. 122. See Appendix A10, A17, A24, A35, A37.
46. Appendix A5, A35.
47. Appendix A3, A4, A6, A22, A39.
48. Appendix A4, A22, A30. See for instance a celebrated diptych in the Louvre, *Inv. OA 4089*: Gaborit-Chopin, *Ivoires médiévaux*, pp. 461-3, no. 201, or another one in the Victoria and Albert Museum, *Inv. 290-1867*: Williamson and Davies, *Medieval Ivory Carvings*, pp. 306-07, no. 102.
49. For a broad panorama of artistic production in Cologne, see Täube and Fleck (eds.), *Glanz und Grösse*.
50. I established a first corpus of 45 carvings in winter 2011-12, building on the lists published by Koechlin, Gaborit-Chopin and Little; I was later able to verify and expand it using the database of the Courtauld Gothic Ivories Project.